

**CAN CREATIVITY BE ACCOMMODATED
IN THE COMPETENCY PARADIGM?
A MUSIC INDUSTRY CASE STUDY**

by
Joy Sotheran

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the
requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy
Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences
at the University of Technology Sydney

2012

Certificate of Authorship/Originality

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Joy Sotheran

Acknowledgements

Thank you Paul Hager, Professor Emeritus, for remaining my Supervisor for so long. I have truly enjoyed your conversation, interest, encouragement and most of all your advice. You have been just the supervisor for me. You have responded with speed and rigour in reading all those drafts, and offered sound ideas to keep me going.

Thank you Timothy Brophy, Associate Professor of Music Education, University of Florida, for so generously sending me all the "in 'press" and published proceedings from the International Symposia on Assessment in Music Education. Thank you also for corresponding with me on particular papers of interest to my dissertation, and for obtaining permission from individual presenters for me to use those papers.

Thank you Andreas Lehmann-Wermser, Professor of Music Education, University of Bremen, for your kind assistance and advice on the Symposia on Assessment in Music Education.

Thank you performers, creators and teachers for generously giving your time and insights in six wonderful conversations on creativity that were critical to this work. Your names are not recorded here but I remember our conversations with delight.

Thank you Daniel Kaan, my husband, mentor and champion. Who else would speak to me of music, neural networks and any other detail of my work along the way? You have edited and proofed my final drafts, made great suggestions, prepared all of the formatting and presentation for my thesis – and spoiled me in every way. Please keep singing to me!

Thank you to all the faculty, library and administrative staff at UTS. Without exception you have always made me feel supported and so grateful to be a UTS student.

Thank you my wonderful friends and family, especially my daughters Jane, Cath and Anneke. You have never failed to cheer me on.

For last year's words belong to last year's language
And next year's words await another voice
And to make an end is to make a beginning
TS Eliot.

Table of Contents

List of Figures	viii
Abstract	ix
1. Introduction: competence and creativity	1
1.1. The thesis	1
1.2. Why a case study?	1
1.3. Why the research?	2
1.4. Language used in the research	3
1.5. Project summary	4
1.6. Structure of the thesis	5
1.6.1. Chapter One – Introduction	5
1.6.2. Chapter Two – The rise of the competency paradigm in Australia	5
1.6.3. Chapter Three – Music genres and learning cultures	6
1.6.4. Chapter Four – Research methodology	6
1.6.5. Chapter five – Accounts of creativity from the literature	6
1.6.6. Chapter Six – The music industry and conversations on creativity	7
1.6.7. Chapter Seven – Musical creativity and competence	7
1.6.8. Chapter Eight – Research findings	7
2. The competency paradigm in Australia: 1980-2005	8
2.1. Overview	8
2.2. Education in Australia	10
2.2.1. A national profile for VET in Australia	14
2.2.2. Competency Based Training	16
2.3. National Training Reform Agenda 1985–95	18
2.3.1. Convergence of industry and education	18
2.3.2. The policy framework	26
2.3.3. Overseeing implementation of the Training Reform Agenda	32
2.4. The Australian Training Framework 1996–2005	37
2.4.1. Abolition of ANTA 2005	38
2.5. Conclusion	39
3. Music genres and learning cultures	40
3.1. Distinguishing classical and popular music genres	40
3.2. Creativity questions	43
3.3. Internal factors as a context for learning and creativity	43
3.4. External factors as a context for music learning	44
3.5. Music education in Australia: the wider context of learning	46
3.5.1. Dissonance between aspirations of excellence and competence	47
3.5.2. Music in Higher Education – an inherited tradition of academic excellence	47
3.5.3. Music education in schools	56
3.5.4. VET and music education and training	60
3.5.5. Convergence in tertiary music education: why the urge to merge?	66
3.6. Assessing creativity: is it “a minefield”?	71
3.6.1. Examples of different assessment contexts	73
3.6.2. CBT and the decoupling of assessment from formal learning	76
3.6.3. The AMEB: another competency based assessment system	77
3.7. Conclusion	80
3.7.1. To what extent is creativity a gift, a behaviour, a competence, or a skill?	81
3.7.2. To what extent can creativity be learned?	81

Can Creativity be Accommodated in the Competency Paradigm? A Music Industry Case Study.

3.7.3. How can we know that it has been learned?	81
4. Research methodology.....	83
4.1. Research method and design overview	84
4.2. The Case study	85
4.3. Data sources	86
4.3.1. Intrinsic case study	87
4.3.2. Problems for the music industry case study	88
4.4. Ethical considerations	90
4.5. Two creativity studies for triangulation with the case study.....	91
4.5.1. Study one: the creativity literature enquiry	91
4.5.2. Study two: music industry creativity enquiry in conversations with practitioners...	93
4.5.3. The case study: CBT creativity items and triangulation.....	96
4.5.4. Strengths and limitations of the methodology	97
5. Creativity: accounts from the literature.....	99
5.1. The creativity literature enquiry in context.....	99
5.2. Scope of literature enquiry	100
5.3. Analytical orientation of the literature review	102
5.3.1. Culture and creativity	102
5.3.2. Contested conceptions of music and categorisations of music cultures	104
5.4. Defining creativity.....	107
5.5. Assessing creativity.....	110
5.6. The creativity literature	111
5.6.1. Navigating creativity: romantic, pragmatic and other accounts	113
5.7. Questions guiding the literature analysis	114
5.8. Popular literature on creativity	115
5.8.1. The first wave: stepping outside the box with new thinking hats.....	116
5.8.2. The second wave: stepping outside academe to influence policy	119
5.8.3. The third wave: neuroscientists step out to explain the brain.....	120
5.9. The scholarly literature.....	123
5.9.1. Intelligence and creativity: highlighting assessment	124
5.9.2. Definitions and accounts of selected creativity theorists.....	129
5.9.3. Dimensions of creativity	141
5.9.4. Creativity, neuroscience and technology	151
5.9.5. Creativity, musicians and music scholars	166
5.10. Conclusion.....	173
5.10.1. To what extent can creativity be described and/or defined?.....	173
5.10.2. How is creativity apprehended, perceived and understood?	175
5.10.3. What factors are most likely to be associated in manifesting creativity?.....	177
5.10.4. To what extent is creativity a gift, a behaviour, a competence, or a skill?.....	178
5.10.5. To what extent can creativity be learned?	178
5.10.6. How can we know that it has been learned?.....	180
5.10.7. What is the significance of creativity for “productive practice / success” in the context of commercial music markets?.....	180
5.10.8. Finally	181
6. The music industry and conversations on creativity	182
6.1. Music	183
6.2. Music markets	184
6.3. Music industry.....	185
6.4. Conversations with music industry practitioners	185
6.4.1. Focus Questions.....	187
6.5. Disengagement with Units of Competency.....	187

Can Creativity be Accommodated in the Competency Paradigm? A Music Industry Case Study.

6.6. Units of Competency selected for creativity	188
6.6.1. Create original music	188
6.6.2. Provide tuition for composition	188
6.6.3. Perform music as soloist	189
6.6.4. Provide instrumental/vocal tuition	189
6.6.5. Develop and practise improvisation	189
6.6.6. Perform improvisation for audience	189
6.6.7. Develop and implement sound production for a recording	189
6.6.8. Develop self as artist	189
6.7. Insights of contemporary music practitioners on creativity	189
6.7.1. Music industry practitioners define creativity	191
6.7.2. Types or modes of creativity	192
6.7.3. Negotiating boundaries of musical creativity	195
6.7.4. Personality and creativity	197
6.7.5. Music as a language: creativity and meaning	197
6.7.6. Teaching and learning creativity	199
6.7.7. Assessing creativity	201
6.7.8. Creativity related Units of Competency and the Training Package	203
6.8. Conclusion	205
6.8.1. To what extent can creativity be described and/or defined?	206
6.8.2. How is creativity apprehended, perceived and understood?	206
6.8.3. What factors are most likely to be associated in manifesting creativity?	206
6.8.4. To what extent is creativity a gift, a behaviour, a competence, or a skill?	207
6.8.5. To what extent can creativity be learned?	207
6.8.6. How can we know that it has been learned?	207
6.8.7. What is the significance of creativity for “productive practice / success” in the context of commercial music markets?	208
6.8.8. Finally	208
7. Musical creativity and competence: the case study	209
7.1. The Music Industry Training Package 01	209
7.2. Training Packages as conveyors of the Australian CBT system	211
7.3. Life cycle of Training Packages	213
7.3.1. Training Package implementation	213
7.4. Structure, reach and implications of Training Packages	214
7.4.1. Accredited courses	215
7.4.2. Concerns with Training Packages	215
7.4.3. Units of Competency	218
7.4.4. Structure of Units of Competency	220
7.5. Purposive sample of eight Units of Competency	221
7.6. Selection of the purposive sample of Units of Competency	222
7.6.1. Composition	224
7.6.2. Performance	224
7.6.3. Tuition	225
7.6.4. Improvisation	225
7.6.5. Sound production	225
7.6.6. Core creative skills	226
7.7. Levels and qualities of creativity in the sample	226
7.8. Convergence of Units of Competency with data sources	226
7.8.1. Create Original Music	227
7.8.2. Provide Tuition for Composition	230
7.8.3. Perform Music as a Soloist	232

Can Creativity be Accommodated in the Competency Paradigm? A Music Industry Case Study.

7.8.4. Provide Instrumental/Vocal Tuition	233
7.8.5. Develop and Practise Improvisation	235
7.8.6. Perform Improvisation for Audience	236
7.8.7. Develop and Implement Sound Production for a Recording	240
7.8.8. Develop Self as Artist	243
7.9. Findings from the case study investigation	245
7.9.1. The degree of creativity specified across the sample units	245
7.9.2. The capacity of the competency approach to develop creative skills	246
7.9.3. What changes might be considered to increase the capacity of any of the selected standards in developing creativity?	246
7.9.4. To what extent does data from the literature enquiry and industry conversations correlate with any aspects of the sampled Units of Competency?	247
7.9.5. Is creativity more important in some areas than in others and if so in what way? ..	247
7.10. Conclusion	248
8. Research findings	249
8.1. To what extent can creativity be described and/or defined?	249
8.2. How is creativity apprehended, perceived and understood?	250
8.3. What is the significance of creativity for “productive practice / success” in the context of commercial music markets?	251
8.4. What factors are most likely to be associated in manifesting creativity?	251
8.5. To what extent is creativity a gift, a behaviour, a competence, or a skill?	252
8.6. To what extent can creativity be learned?	253
8.7. Can we know when creativity has been learned?	254
8.8. Conclusion	257
Appendix A: Glossary	259
Appendix B: Industry conversations	261
Conversation 1: Music Teacher in TAFE	261
Conversation 2: RTO Chief Executive Officer	271
Conversation 3: Performer / High School Music Teacher	275
Conversation 4: Artists Manager	280
Conversation 5: Composer	287
Conversation 6: Performer / University Academic	298
Appendix C: Units of Competency	311
Unit of Competency 1: CUSMCP05A: Create original music	311
Unit of Competency 2: CUSLRN03A: Provide tuition for composition	317
Unit of Competency 3: CUSMPF15A: Perform music as a soloist	323
Unit of Competency 4: CUSLRN02A: Provide instrumental/vocal tuition	328
Unit of Competency 5: CUSMPF10A: Develop and practice improvisation	336
Unit of Competency 6: CUSMPF16A: Perform improvisation for audience	340
Unit of Competency 7: CUSSOU17A: Develop and implement sound production for a recording	344
Unit of Competency 8: CUSMGE02A: Develop self as artist	349
Appendix D: Participant consent forms	354
Letter to prospective participants	354
List of questions for participants	355
Participant consent form	357
Bibliography	358

List of Figures

Figure 1: Molino's tripartite model.....	140
--	-----

Abstract

The primary question of this research is; can creativity be accommodated in the competency system? A number of enquiries underpin consideration of this question. Two enquiries give background to the study. Firstly, consideration is given to the genesis of the competency system in the Australia socio-political context. Secondly, musical creativity is considered from the wider educational perspective in which Vocational Education and Training is situated.

Thirdly, a literature enquiry investigates popular and scholarly domains to identify theories of creativity as a basis for better understanding creativity. Fourthly, conversations with six popular commercial music industry practitioners, working creative artists, artist managers and teachers in the popular commercial music industry, evoke direct experience and understanding of musical creativity in the context of the case study.

Finally, specific competency items are measured against the findings of the preceding enquiries, that delineate creativity, to test the suitability of Competency Based Training learning and assessment materials to deal with creativity. These Competency Based Training items form the case study.